SCALING ACCESS TO DFS SERVICES FOR SMALLHOLDERS IN TANZANIA
INSIGHTS FROM CASHEW NUT VALUE CHAIN

Paul Kweheria and Happy Mathew
Mercy Corps
AgriFin Accelerate Tanzania
Contents

i. Executive Summary

ii. Cashew Context & Background

iii. Assessment of Successes and Challenges from Payments Pilot

iv. Building on insights from Pilot- Assessment of Farmer Needs

v. Recommendations for improving DFS offerings to SHFs

vi. Potential Additional Value Chains
Executive Summary

Cashew Nut Act (2017-18): All cashew nut farmers to sell through Agriculture Marketing Cooperatives (AMCOS) and receive payments through a bank account.

**Cashew Sector 2017:**
- 300K+ Cashew Farmers
- 265K+ Cashew Metric Tons
- 350M USD

**OUTCOMES:**
- 200K Bank Accounts
- Financial Inclusion
- Risk
- Fraud

**CHALLENGES:**
- Trust
- Payment Delays
- Financial Literacy
- Value Addition
Farmers’ Spending and Borrowing Behaviours

Income
- Cashew (main)
- Others (Maize, Sesame)
- Different seasons

Expenses
- Daily household expenses
- Agricultural inputs
- House improvement

Borrowing
- Family and friends
- Savings groups
- Local money lenders

Strategic Levers for Engaging Farmers with DFS

- Enhance FSP Value proposition:
  - Input and emergency loans
  - Targeted savings for inputs - staple
  - Insurance - risk mitigation

- Build sustainable agent networks using varying models
  - Expand access points
  - Increase liquidity in rural areas

- Improve payment options and service points to allow digital transactions and reduce cash out
Cashew Context and Background

Overview

- World’s 8th largest producer and the fourth largest producer in Africa
- 3rd largest export crop in Tanzania after coffee and cotton accounting for over 10% of agricultural exports in 2013
- The value chain is dominated by smallholder farmers primarily in the Southern Regions of the Country

PRODUCTION REGIONS
Cashew is produced in the southern regions of Tanzania

80-90% of national production from Mtwara (150,000 farmers) and Lindi (100,000 farmers)
10% from other areas such as Ruvuma and Pwani

Market Size

265,000 MT
Total cashew nut production in 2016/2017

300,000
Farmers engaged in production*

Tsh. 780 Billion (US 350M)
Value of cashew nuts purchased in 2017**

* Farmers engaged in production
** Value of cashew nuts purchased in 2017
The cashew nut value chain is highly structured with farmers required to aggregate their produce to warehouses through AMCOS and are then sell through an auction process.
The Problem: In the previous cash-based system, buyers made payments via bank accounts to Cooperative Unions, which distributed cash to AMCOS to pay individual farmers resulting in Tsh. 5.7 billion in leakages and security risks for AMCOS and farmers.

**Key:**
- **Flow of cash**
- **Challenges**

**Source:** *FinScope Tanzania 2017*
The Response: the Cashewnut Act 2017-18 now requires cashew farmers to receive payment via banks accounts. Mobile money was piloted as an alternative avenue for farmers receiving cashew payments of under Tsh. 3 million

Policy and Pilot Objectives

- Reduce fraud and leakages resulting from poor documentation
- Reduce security risks to AMCOS leaders and farmers.
- Reduce payment delays
- Improve financial inclusion for farmers
Assessment of Digital Payment Pilot

Digital payments (bank and mobile) to cashew farmers registered initial success:

1. Registration of +200,000 accounts
   - Established pathway to financial inclusion\(^1\)
   - 63\% of people in Mtwara and Lindi were formally included with 80\% living within 5km of a financial access point.
   - Digital payments facilitated inclusion of SHFs receiving low amounts and provided an entry point for FSPs to other services such as loans, insurance and pension.

2. Reduced security risks
   - Farmers risk has shifted to exposure when cashing out at bank or MNO channels
   - CUUs and AMCOS save up to Tsh. 400 million per season in cash handling costs

3. Reduced fraud and leakages
   - Across the payment process, fraud and leakages estimated to have reduced by 80\%\(^2\). This is due to reduced human errors counting cash and Multiple reconciliations

“We had to hire armed guards and cars to take the cash to the AMCOS. Robbers would always be waiting along the way” - Amani Rusaki, Regional Officer, Department of Economic Growth, Mtwara

“Farmers now know how much they are supposed to receive because they get messages on their phone. Some will even come to you, and claim Tsh. 20 because the message receipt says maybe Tsh. 3820 was the selling price.” - Nnape, Tuaminiane AMCOS chair
Many farmers experienced payments delays with the introduction of digital payments; up to 9 weeks for mobile.

Distrust of AMCOS persists and farmers show discomfort with FSPs due to fraud experience and an opaque payment process.

There is limited perceived value proposition for farmers to use existing products and channels-leading to immediate cashout hence limiting future financing.

Challenges Leading to Delays in Cashew Payments

1. Farmer registration and submission
   Farmers registered and submitted account information to AMCOS late which was often incorrect.

2. Account collection
   AMCOS are poorly equipped to collect and reconcile farmer account information.

3. Troubleshooting
   Poor troubleshooting systems delayed payments.

4. Payment transfers (Human factor)
   AMCOS did not follow the process of transferring payments and submitting payment database to mobile wallet operator.

4. Payment transfers (Systemic factor)
   Payment transfers within and across banks and MNOs slowed processing and delivery of payments.

Key: → Flow of money ← Flow of information

* Delays are an acute challenge for farmers because farmers value speed when engaging with digital payments.
Building on insights from Pilot- Assessment of Farmer Needs

Developing DFS for cashew farmers requires understanding their livelihoods in terms of income streams and expenditures

**Income Streams**
- Farmers supplement cashew earnings through maize, soy beans, cow peas, and vegetables.
- Other income include livestock and shops.

**Expenditures**
- Farmers spend on Inputs, Invest in livestock, home improvements, food, and loan repayments

- Cashew farmers make an average of 4 million TZS per year and spend about 12% of their income on agricultural inputs
- Cashflow varies throughout the year based on the crop calendar, highlighting seasonal financing needs
Examples of Farmers’ Financial Needs

1. Input financing for other crops after they harvest the main cash crop e.g. cashew.
2. Building materials and working capital
3. Strong *wakala* and merchant ecosystem

“*I took my cashews in October, but I got paid in December. I needed to plant maize and rice in November. Where was I meant to go get money for the inputs?*”

- Kanduru, Farmer, Mpowora

Farmer Borrowing Behaviors

- Savings groups
- Formal loans remain out of reach
  - Cumbersome application process
  - Documentary requirements
- Low perception of loan size received
- High interest (10% per month) alternative loans
- Borrow input loans for planting and harvest
3 Strategic Levers

- Keep cashew payments in their bank and mobile accounts
- Utilize FSP products beyond a payment channel (raising financial literacy)

### SHORT TERM

1. **PRODUCT AND MESSAGING**
   - Improving existing and introducing new products
   - Savings products
   - Saving for Loan eligibility

2. **AGENT NETWORK**
   - Scaling agent networks and managing liquidity
   - Surge roving agents
   - Convert farmers

3. **MERCHANT PAYMENTS**
   - Expanding payment points using card and mobile payments
   - Convert merchants
   - Transaction fees
   - Loyalty bonuses

### MEDIUM-LONG TERM

- **Loan insurance products for farmers**
- **Loan product through agents**
- **Convert suppliers to mobile**
- **Re-introduce withdrawal fees**
Despite the distrust around them, AMCOS can be leveraged as an entry point for providing DFS to farmers, given their integral role in day-to-day activities.

Advantages of using AMCOS as an entry point for digital financial services:

- **Proximity to farmers:** AMCOS are located near farmers’ homes to give farmers easy accessibility hence they can be used as service points.
- **Trusted source of information:** AMCOS have long existing relationships with farmers which makes them a trusted source of information on products and services.
- **Knowledge of farmer needs:** AMCOS are an integral part of farming communities and understand their needs, constraints and opportunities for engagement.

Reasons behind perceived diminishing role of AMCOS in the cashew value chain:

- **Aggregation is not exclusive:** Since any farmer can drop off their cashew at an AMCO regardless of membership, farmers don’t see the value of being an AMCO member.
- **Payments no longer need to be collected at AMCOS:** Digitization of cashew payments, which has reduced the need for interacting with AMCO leaders.
- **Lack of additional services offered by AMCOS:** AMCOS can no longer access group loans on behalf of farmers using warehouse receipts as collateral, leaving farmers with no access to payment advances. School fees advances are also no longer necessary due to the introduction of free primary and secondary education creating a lack of value addition AMCOS can provide to farmers.
There is an opportunity to invest in improving current DFS channel services provided by AMCOS

**Current AMCOS services and how to improve them:**

**BRANDING BUILDING AND AWARENESS**
AMCOS advertise different banking options
- Comprehensive understanding of the different options and the ability to provide better digital and financial literacy training to farmers is needed

**ACCOUNT INFORMATION COLLECTION**
The collection of account information by AMCOS is highly error prone
- Digitization of the process would reduce mistakes and delays - this includes AMCOS using computers to collect account information

**PRODUCT USE & TROUBLE-SHOOTING**
AMCOS are the first touch points for farmer concerns and are unequipped to assist farmers
- Training and capacity building would improve their ability to handle and escalate queries

**PAYMENT RECONCILIATION**
AMCOS receive sales information from warehouses, prepare payment list and submit to DCO for approval which prolongs payments
- Digitization of system would reduce delays
There is an opportunity to invest in improving current DFS channel services provided by AMCOS

Examples of Other Value Chains

- **COFFEE**
  - Largest export crop in Tanzania with over 450,000 smallholder farmers engaged in production
  - Highly structured value chain with local and international off-takers

- **COTTON**
  - ~2 million Tanzanians depend on cotton for their livelihood, which also provides ~13% of the country’s foreign exchange
  - Highly structured value chain with local and international off-takers

- **SESAME**
  - Tanzania is the 12th largest sesame producer in the world
  - Farmers will start using the Warehouse Receipt system in 2018/2019 season

- **SUNFLOWER**
  - Significant local demand for sunflower
  - High level of integration across the value chain through contract farming
Thank You